



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/473,098	12/28/1999	JULIO ESTRADA	L09-99-047	9594

7590 11/10/2003

STEPHEN KEOHANE
LOTUS DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION
55 CAMBRIDGE PARKWAY
CAMBRIDGE, MA 02142

EXAMINER

SHIN, KYUNG H

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

2132

DATE MAILED: 11/10/2003

7

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

2

Office Action Summary

Application No.

09/473,098

Applicant(s)

ESTRADA ET AL.

Examiner

Kyung H Shin

Art Unit

2132

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 28 December 1999.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-15 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-15 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☒ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 14 January 2002 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
- Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- 11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on _____ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.
- If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
- 1) ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 - 2) ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 - 3) ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
- * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).
- a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 15) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s). _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 3) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) <u>5,6</u> . | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: |

DETAILED ACTION

Claims 1-15 are presented for examination

Specification

The disclosure is objected to because of the following informalities:

On page 1 and 2, please fill in the blank space with the application number, date of filing and status of the application. Please delete assigned docket numbers from each application. On page 35, please fill in co-pending patent application information and please delete assigned docket number.

Appropriate correction is required.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

1. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

2. **Claims 1 - 15** are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Salas et al (U.S. Patent No. 6,233,600; filed date 15 July 1997).

In regard to **claim 1**, Salas discloses a collaboration space (see Figs. 1 and 4; col. 5, lines 6 – 11 et seq.), comprising:

Art Unit: 2132

- a) a place comprising a plurality of rooms linked by pointers (see Fig. 4; col. 5 line 60 - col. 6 line1);
- b) a member directory for place identifying users authorized to enter place (see Fig. 1; col. 3, lines 49-57); and
- c) each room comprising one or more pages, and for each room a members object for identifying members authorized to access room and for each member a level of authorization (see Fig. 1; col. 3, line 57- col. 4, line 3).

In regard to **claim 2**, Salas discloses the claimed collaboration space of levels of authorization including manager, author, and reader (see col. 13, lines 27 - 37).

In regard to **claim 3**, Salas discloses the collaboration space of rooms including a parent room and a child room, and pointers comprising forward and backward pointers for enabling the security of each room to be independently managed (see col. 6, lines 39 - 55).

In regard to **claim 4**, Salas discloses the claimed collaboration space of each forward pointer further comprising a readers field, readers field including an access authority for each reader authorized to enter room (see col. 7, lines 8 - 10).

In regard to **claim 5**, Salas discloses the claimed collaboration space of claim 3, each said forward pointer being secure pointer (see col. 8, lines 12 - 16).

In regard to **claim 6**, Salas discloses the claimed collaboration space of claim 5, each said forward pointer carrying the same security as that of the subroom to which it points (see col. 8, lines 51 - 54).

In regard to **claim 7**, Salas discloses the claimed collaboration space of claim 6, further comprising a display for presenting to a specific user viewing a parent room a listing of

Art Unit: 2132

its subrooms, listing including for specific user only those subrooms for which a readers field in forward pointer includes an entry authorizing access by specific user (see col. 12, lines 7 - 22).

In regard to **claim 8**, Salas discloses the claimed database access control system (see col. 14, line 30), comprising:

- a) an access control list for specifying users who can or cannot access said database (see col. 14, lines 31 - 36);
- b) for users authorized to access said database, said access control list further specifying access levels and roles determining the specific actions said users are authorized to perform, said roles including reader, author, and manager (see col. 14, lines 37 - 44);
- c) a form selectively including a form access list (see col. 13, lines 27 - 34);
- d) database including one or more documents created from form (see col. 13, lines 46 - 51);
- e) form access list identifying users authorized to read documents created from said form (see col. 13, lines 38 - 46);
- f) each document including a document access field selectively including a readers field and an authors field for controlling who can read or modify said document (see col. 14, lines 46 - 50); users identified in any said form access list for said form from which said document was created being included in said readers field (see col. 14, lines 50 - 54);

Art Unit: 2132

- g) entries in readers field granting authorization to an individual user equal to or less than the authorization for individual user in access control list (see col. 14, lines 46 - 50); and
- h) entries in said authors field selectively granting authorization to a user authorized as an author in said access control list to edit a document, which said author creates (see col. 14, lines 46 - 50).

In regard to **claim 9, 13, 14, and 15**, Salas discloses the claimed method or program storage device or computer program product or article of manufacture for controlling access to rooms within a collaboration place, comprising the steps of:

- a) maintaining for said collaboration place an access control list identifying those users authorized to enter said place (see Fig. 1; col. 3, lines 49-57);
- b) providing pointers linking said rooms within said place, said pointers including forward pointers having a readers field (see Fig. 4; col. 5, line 60 - col. 6 line1);
- c) displaying a parent room to a specific user, parent room including a list of children rooms for which reader's fields authorize specific user access (see col. 6, lines 39 - 55).

Examiner notes that it is clear to those of ordinary skill in the art how to incorporate the program storage device of claim 13 into an article of manufacture.

In regard to **claim 10**, Salas discloses the claimed method for creating a child room within a collaboration place database, comprising the steps of:

- a) providing for said data base an access control list identifying users authorized to access said data base (see col. 14, lines 31 - 36); providing for said child room a back pointer to a parent room (see col. 6, lines 39 - 55); and

Art Unit: 2132

- b) providing at said parent room for said child room a forward pointer from said parent room, said pointer including a readers access field listing users authorized to access said child room (see Fig. 4; col. 5, line 60 - col. 6 line1).

In regard to **claim 11**, Salas discloses the claimed method of claim, further comprising the steps of:

- a) limiting reader access in said readers access field to said child room for a specific user to no more than the access granted said specific user in said access control list (see col. 14, lines 37 - 54).

In regard to **claim 12**, Salas discloses the claimed method of claim, further comprising the step of initially including in said readers access field for a child room created from a form users identified in a form access list identifying users authorized to read rooms created from said form (see col. 13, lines 38 - 51).

Conclusion

The prior art made of record and not relied upon is considered pertinent to applicant's disclosure.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Kyung H Shin whose telephone number is 703-305 - 0711. The examiner can normally be reached on 6:30 am - 4:30 pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Gilberto Barron can be reached on 703-305-1830. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Art Unit: 2132

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-305-2394.

Kyung H. Shin

Kyung H Shin
Patent Examiner
Art Unit 2132

KHS
October 31, 2003

Greg Q Morse

GREGORY MORSE
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2100